

MINUTES OF THE 13TH MEETING (EMERGENCY) OF THE SYNDICATE

Friday 06TH January, 2017 Islamia College Peshawar



ISLAMIA COLLEGE PESHAWAR Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa (PAKISTAN)



ISLAMIA COLLEGE PESHAWAR

KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA (PAKISTAN) Tel: +92-(0)91-9222036 Fax: +92-(0)91-9216432 Url: www.icp.edu.pk Emalil: registrar@icp.edu.pk



No.<u>251</u>/(Meetings)

Dated: 17/ 04 /2017

То

All Members of the Syndicate Islamia College, Peshawar

Subject: <u>MINUTES OF THE 13TH MEETING (EMERGENCY) OF THE</u> SYNDICATE, ISLAMIA COLLEGE, PESHAWAR.

Dear Sir/Madam,

I am directed to send herewith a copy of the final Minutes of the 13th meeting (Emergency) of the Syndicate, Islamia College Peshawar held on January 06, 2017 in the Main Committee Room, Islamia College, Peshawar for your information and record.

Thanking you.

Encl: as stated above.

Sincerely

(Dr. Muhammad Tauqir Alam) Registrar

Copy to:

- 1. The Deputy Registrar (Estt.) for record.
- 2. The Deputy Registrar (Academics) fro record.
- 3. The Deputy Registrar (Meetings) for record.
- 4. The PS to Vice-Chancellor

MINUTES OF THE 13TH SYNDICATE (EMERGENCY) MEETING HELD ON FRIDAY 6th JANUARY, 2017 at 02.30 pm IN THE MAIN COMMITTEE ROOM OF ISLAMIA COLLEGE, PESHAWAR

The 13th meeting of the Syndicate (Emergency) was held under the Chairmanship of Prof. Dr. Habib Ahmad, the Chairman of the Syndicate and Vice Chancellor, Islamia College, Peshawar. The meeting started with recitation from the Holy Quran. (List of participants is attached herewith).

The Chairperson welcomed all the participants. He made it clear at the onset that in the previous Syndicate meeting some objections were raised regarding the eligibility of some candidates, who were, duly recommended by the Selection Board of the University. He said that the 12th Syndicate constituted a 3-members Committee convened by Dr. Khalid Khan, the Additional Secretary Higher Education Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Dr. Izhar Ahmad and Mr. Awal Said as its members. As per TORs, the findings of the Committee have now been tabled before the Syndicate.

Before the proceedings could formally take off, Assistant Prof. Dr. Izhar Ahmad raised the question that was there any emergency to convene Syndicate meeting? Lecturer Mr. Awal Said also urged that the word emergency has not created a good impression about the University. He opined that the Chairman should have called a Special Meeting. However, the Registrar declared it emergency meeting as per Rules of Business.

Dr. Khalid Khan, the Additional Secretary, HED further added that the matter of certain appointment cases had taken the entire University into its grip and a situation had been arisen where the University administration had to decide to call an emergency meeting to calm down restlessness in the University.

The Vice Chancellor and Chairman of the Syndicate, Prof. Dr. Habib Ahmad made it clear in response to certain queries from Dr. Izhar Ahmad and Mr. Awal said that this was a single-agenda-item meeting pertaining to tabling of findings of a report of a "Syndicateconstituted Committee to inquire into the objections raised on the eligibility of the recommended candidates". That was why, he said, it had been called an Emergency meeting. He said that being Chairman of the Syndicate, he felt to convene an emergency meeting, after fulfilling codal formalities.

In response to submissions from Associate Prof. Dr. Muhammad Saleem Khan, the Vice Chancellor held that the appointment cases would be treated, scrutinized and processed under the same rules, criteria and statutes, under which their advertisements were made. 'We are autonomous body to deal with our matters ourselves,'

MINUTES OF THE 13TH MEETING (EMERGENCY) OF THE SYNDICATE, ISLAMIA COLLEGE, PESHAWAR HELD ON 06TH JANUARY, 2017

The Syndicate approved that the posts which have already been advertised, will be decided under the same requisite criteria.

Associate Prof. Dr. Muhammad Saleem Khan also submitted a letter to the Chairman. The Registrar read out that letter which was from the Directorate of Quality Enhancement, University of Peshawar (December 7, 2015 marked to Assistant Registrar-Meetings with subject *Verification of Research Publications*). Mr. Awal Said pointed out that under Article 46-B of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Universities Act (Amendment), 2012, all such notifications and decisions of the University of Peshawar had been adopted automatically. The Vice Chancellor directed to make this letter a part of record. However, Dr. Muhammad Saleem Khan, and Mr. Awal Said recorded the following:

<u>Vote of Protest</u>: The discriminatory attitude in respect of announcement, processing and dealing with appointment cases should be done away with. Our protest is that the posts have been announced under old criteria and being processed under the new criteria. These should be dealt with under the same criteria under which they were advertised.

The nominee of the Chief Justice of High Court of Peshawar, Mr. Justice (retired) Abdul Aziz Kundi pointed out that the name of Ali Abbas Mirza had not been mentioned in the Inquiry Report. Prof. Dr. Syed Inayat Ali Shah, Dean, Faculty of Physical & Numerical Sciences, who raised age-limit objection in the 12th meeting of the Syndicate, however, clarified that the matter was related to age-limit and not with specific names of individuals. In fact, Prof. Dr. Syed Inayat Ali Shah said, the names of three persons were mentioned: Muhammad Akbar Amin, Ali Abbas Mirza and Imtiaz Hussain. However, only one name had been appeared on record of the Inquiry Report proceedings.

The Syndicate then formally took up one-point agenda. With the permission of the Chair, Additional Secretary Education, Dr. Khalid Khan, the Convener of 'Syndicate-constituted Committee' tabled the report for discussion. Lecturer Mr. Awal Said read out the report:

1. <u>ELIGIBILITY CASE OF MR. MUHAMMAD AKBAR AMIN FOR THE POST</u> OF ASSISTANT REGISTRAR

Dr. Syed Inayat Ali Shah referred to Appointment Rules and Regulations in case of age objection on Mr. Akbar Amin. These rules set 21-35 years age limit for the post of Assistant Registrar.

The Vice Chancellor, Prof. Dr. Habib Ahmad directed to summon forthwith the then Registrar (Prof. Dr. Sareer Badshah) and Deputy Registrar (Mr. Daud Zahid) to clarify the issue



regarding such matters, as these appointment cases were advertised during their tenure. At the same time, Associate Prof. Dr. Izhar Ahmad referred to a letter from the University of Peshawar which certified that there was no clearly defined Age limit for the appointment in BPS-17 and above. Secondly, no age limit was mentioned in said advertisement.

The Vice Chancellor and other members, upon this clarification, declared Mr. Muhammad Akbar Amin eligible for the post of Assistant Registrar.

2. <u>ELIGIBILITY CASE OF MS. NASREEN GHAFFAR FOR THE POST OF</u> <u>DEPUTY REGISTRAR (MEETINGS)</u>

In case of Ms. Nasreen Ghaffar, the Chairman of Syndicate, Prof. Dr. Habib Ahmad, and Dean, Faculty of Physical & Numerical Sciences, Prof. Dr. Inayat Ali Shah were of the view that she has been declared eligible by the scrutiny committee and further recommended by the Selection Board strictly in accordance with the prevalent rules.

However, Prof. Dr. Ali Muhammad, Associate Prof. Dr. Muhmmad Saleem Khan, Assistant Prof. Dr. Izhar Ahmed and Lecturer Mr. Awal Said maintained that in this case legal requirements have not been fulfilled.

This difference of opinion resulted in the walk out of members namely Prof. Dr. Ali Muhammad, Associate Prof. Dr. Muhammad Saleem Khan, and Assistant Prof. Dr. Izhar Ahmed. However, Lecturer Mr. Awal Said remained in the Committee Room and continued attending the proceedings of Syndicate meeting. At this stage, the position of attendance was as follows:

- 1. Prof. Dr. Habib Ahmad (the Chairman of Syndicate)
- 2. Mr. Justice (retired) Abdul Aziz Kundi
- 3. Dr. Khalid Khan (Additional Secretary, HED)
- 4. Prof. Dr. Samadyar Hussain (Dean Faculty of Natural Sciences, ICP)
- Prof. Dr. Syed Inayat Ali Shah (Dean, Faculty of Physical & Numerical Sciences, ICP)
- 6. Mr. Asim Khattak (Additional Secretary Finance)
- 7. Mr. Ijaz Akram Khan (nominee of the Additional Secretary Establishment)
- 8. Mr. Awal Said (elected Syndicate Member for Lecturers Constituency)
- 9. Mr. Khalid Dilawar (Treasurer-acting, ICP)
- 10. Dr. Muhamad Tauqir Alam (Registrar-cum-Secretary-acting)

3

Despite boycott of three of the Syndicate members (Prof. Dr. Ali Muhammad, Associate Prof. Muhammad Saleem Khan, and Assistant Prof. Dr. Izhar Ahmad), the quorum of the Syndicate remained intact (i.e. 2/3 of the existing members). No member drew attention of the Chair or the Secretary of the Syndicate towards any kind of deficient quorum.

The additional Secretary Finance on this occasion remarked that the forum should not be ethically driven to a point where it stops functioning. He said that we have all respect for the worthy Vice Chancellor and if he says that such things have been decided in accordance with law then we have no objection in this regard.

Mr. Awal Said, who did not stage boycott walk out with remaining three members (Prof. Dr. Ali Mohammad, Associate Prof. Muhammad Saleem Khan, and Assistant Prof. Izhar Ahmad) took part in discussion on eligibility criteria of Deputy Registrar. He raised the question of re-advertisement of post for the Deputy Registrar. He called in question that who had the authority to re-advertise the post? Mr. Daud Zahid, Incharge Legal Cell, Islamia College Peshawar and who was called for assisting and apprising the Syndicate members in the matter, told the following:

- i) Re-advertisement is no issue and does not tend to any illegality.
- The objections regarding appeals of the in-eligible were overruled. Appeals were duly entertained, processed and referred back to the Scrutiny Committee for reconsideration.
- Remarks of the Scrutiny Committee were shown to Justice (retired) Abdul Aziz Kundi.
- iv) Legal Opinion sought in this regard.
- v) Equal opportunity had been given to all the candidates.
- vi) He informed that the post was properly re-advertised and it was neither done by the Vice Chancellor nor by the Registrar Office. He showed a document authenticating that the re-advertisement of post(s) was carried out on the insistence of Administrative Staff Association because the Association raised the matter that the post of Deputy Registrar establishment has become promotional post.

The Additional Secretary, HED, Dr. Khalid Khan said that we have already given our opinion in writing to the Syndicate and we are not going to change it. We can only give explanation.

The Syndicate, after this debate, approved the case of Ms. Nasreen Ghaffar for the post of Deputy Registrar (Meetings).

3. <u>ELIGIBILITY CASE OF DR. TARIQ JAN FOR PROFESSOR OF</u> <u>CHEMISTRY</u>

Prof. Dr. Syed Inayat Ali Shah raised question about the findings of the Committee with respect to Dr. Muhammad Tariq Jan for the post Professor of Chemistry. However, after elaborating the existing criteria and debate on patent marks, the Syndicate accepted the same and approved appointment of Prof. Dr. M. Tariq Jan as Professor of Chemistry.

4. <u>ELIGIBILITY CASE OF DR. GOHAR ZAMAN FOR PROFESSOR OF</u> <u>MANAGEMENT SCIENCES/PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION</u>

With regards to Associate Professor Dr. Gohar Zaman appointment as full professor of Management Sciences/Public Administration, the Inquiry Committee did not raise any question with the exception of relevancy of research papers. The participants approved the appointment of Dr. Gohar Zaman as Professor of Management Sciences/Public Administration after going through a letter of Higher Education Commission that confirmed his research papers as per requirements.

Mr. Awal Said raised the question of the eligibility/qualification of the members of the Syndicate. He objected to the presence of acting Registrar and acting Treasurer as according to him both of these officers are not a part of the Syndicate. Additional Secretary Finance clarified that in case of absence of Secretary, we have acting Secretary-Finance who exercises full powers. If you don't have regular Registrar then your acting registrar will look after the office with full powers, he further said.

Mr. Justice (retired) Abdul Aziz Kundi further clarified that in the last meeting of the Syndicate held in December 2016, this issue had been raised and settled down that Acting Registrar can be a part of the Syndicate and can conduct its meetings. He said that Registrar's presence was in order for the purpose of fulfilling the quorum requirements. The syndicate overruled the objections of Mr. Awal Said, upon which he went out of the meeting calmly.

5. ELIGIBILITY CASE OF DR. HAFIZ HIFAZAT ULLAH

In case of Appointment of Assistant Prof. Hafiz Hifazat Ullah as Associate Professor, the Syndicate deferred the matter till the arrival of HEC report on the eligibility of the candidate.

6. ELIGIBILITY CASE OF DR. SALEEM-UR-REHMAN

A lengthy discussion took place in case of Associate Prof. Dr. Saleem-ur-Rehman. Objections raised on the eligibility of Dr. Saleem-ur-Rehman, because of plagiarism charges

5

on him. The case, however, decided in the light of Syndicate decision taken on 13-10-2016 and his case was withdrawn as agenda item from the agenda of the 13th Syndicate (emergency)

At the end, Dr. Khalid Khan, Additional Secretary, HED, recorded the following:

My request very humbly would be you have to [be] very particular in taking care of points raised in the bullets in this report [Inquiry Report]. He pointed out that there are serious lapses (have taken place) on the part of the University in appointments and promotions matters. This report should be taken as a lesson. Now while the University is reviewing its Statutes, it has a chance to remove anomalies in its selection procedures. Each of the bullet of this report do not ignore and be given due care for future transparency. Your process of scrutiny and process of quantification for the recruitment is still not standardized. My humble request is that these bullets should not be ignored.

The Vice Chancellor, Prof. Dr. Habib Ahmad, while concluding the proceedings of emergency Syndicate assured that we have to bring the University forward in all fields. The cases/things which we discussed today were not new rather these were years old cases. He said that these cases he inherited as past legacy and he wanted to sort out a solution to these cases. He said that it was his determination to restart the system where he found it stopped so that the University should go forward. He said that in the new advertisements for the vacant positions, all such anomalies will be addressed properly.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the Chair with a law to resolve the issues with mutual cooperation and harmony in future.

Minutes Recorded by:

Registrar

(Dr. M. Tauqir Alam)

Confirmed:

Prof. Dr. Habib Ahmad Vice Chancellor Islamia College, Peshawar

MINUTES OF THE 13TH MEETING (EMERGENCY) OF THE SYNDICATE, ISLAMIA COLLEGE, PESHAWAR HELD ON 06TH JANUARY, 2017

6

OBSERVATIONS MADE ON THE MINUTES OF THE 13TH (EMERGENCY) MEETING OF THE SYNDICATE HEL ON 06th JANUARY, 2017

Minutes Recorded in agenda Item	Observations	Remarks
	Observations made by Prof. Dr. Syed Inayat Ali Shah Member of the Syndicate, Islamia College Peshawar Prof. Dr. Syed Inayat Ali Shah raised question about the findings of the Committee with respect to Dr. Muhammad Tariq Jan for the post Professor of Chemistry. However, after elaborating the existing criteria and debate on patent marks, the Syndicate accepted the same and approved appointment of Prof. Dr. M. Tariq Jan as Professor of Chemistry. The same may kindly be incorporated in Minutes accordingly.	Will be Incorporated in the minutes accordingly.

Registrar

Islamia College Peshawar

Page 1 of 1

THIRTEENTH SYNDICATE, ISLAMIA COLLEGE PESHAWAR DATED 06" JANUARY, 2017

ATTENDANCE SHEET

Participants of the 13th Meeting (Emergency) of the Syndicate held on Friday, January 05, 2017 at 02:30 pm in the Main Committee Room, Vice-Chancellor Secretariat, Islamia College Peshawar.

Sr.#	Members	Signature
1.	Vice-Chancellor Islamia College Peshawar	(Thus
2.	Justice (Rtd.) Abdul Aziz Kundi	Mors Condi
3.	Secretary to Government , Higher Education Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	=
4.	Secretary to Government, Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	R) Ela
5.	Secretary to Government, Establishment Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	1011second
6.	Prof. Dr. Masoom Yasinzai Rector, International Islamic University (IIU), Islamabad	
7.	Prof. Dr. Naushad Khan Dean, Faculty of Social Sciences, Arts & Languages, Islamia College Peshawar	
8.	Prof. Dr. Syed Inayat Ali Shah Dean, Faculty of Physical & Numerical Sciences, Islamia College Peshawar	MA
9.	Prof. Dr. Sheikh Samad Yar Hussain Dean, Faculty of life & Chemical Sciences, Islamia College, Peshawar	3730 -05/11/2017
10.	Prof. Dr. Ali Muhammad Chairman, Department of Zoology, Islamia College Peshawar	
11.	Dr. Muhammad Saleem Khan Chairman, Department of Botany, Islamia College Peshawar	
12.	Dr. Izhar Ahmed Assistant Professor, Department of Botany, Islamia College Peshawar	
13.	Mr. Awal Said Lecturer, Department of English, Islamia College Peshawar	
14.	Registrar Islamia College Peshawar	206-1-勝
15	Khalid Dilawar Tzasses	